

# NON-SINGLY-GENERATED CLOSED IDEALS IN GROUP ALGEBRAS

BY  
A. ATZMON<sup>1</sup>

ABSTRACT

We investigate the problem whether every closed ideal in the group algebras  $A(G)$  is generated by a single function. For the algebras  $A_r(R^n)$ ,  $n \geq 6$ , we give a negative solution. We also obtain some negative results for general locally compact abelian groups.

**Introduction.** For a locally compact abelian group  $G$  with dual  $\Gamma$ , we denote by  $A(G)$  the set of all Fourier transforms of functions in  $L^1(\Gamma)$ . That is:

$$f \in A(G) \Leftrightarrow f(g) = \int_{\Gamma} (g, \gamma) F(\gamma) d\gamma,$$
$$g \in G, \gamma \in \Gamma, F \in L^1(\Gamma);$$

with the norm

$$\|f\| = \int_{\Gamma} |F(\gamma)| d\gamma$$

$A(G)$  is a commutative Banach algebra and  $G$  is its maximal ideal space.  $A_r(G)$  denotes the algebra of real functions in  $A(G)$ .

It is not known whether every closed ideal in  $A(G)$  is generated by a single function. In this paper we discuss this problem, and prove some results in the negative direction.

In Section 1 we investigate the relation of this problem to spectral synthesis.

In Section 2 we consider the algebras  $A(R^n)$  for  $n \geq 6$ , and show the existence of closed self adjoint ideals which are not generated by any real function. This

---

<sup>1</sup> This paper is a part of the author's Ph. D. thesis prepared at the Hebrew University of Jerusalem under the supervision of Professor Y. Katznelson, to whom the author wishes to express his thanks for his helpful guidance, and valuable remarks.

Received June 4, 1969.

implies that in the algebras  $A_c(R^n)$ ,  $n \geq 6$ , there exist closed ideals which are not singly generated.

Section 3 is devoted to the study of the problem in general algebras  $A(G)$ , for non discrete locally compact abelian groups  $G$ . We show, that in every such algebra, there exist two real functions  $f_1, f_2$ , and a compact set  $E \subset G$ , such that the closed ideal generated by  $f_1$  and  $f_2$  in  $A(G)$  is not generated by any function  $f$  which identifies every pair of points in  $E$  that is identified by both  $f_1$  and  $f_2$ . This implies that  $A(G)$  contains a closed subalgebra with closed ideals which are not singly generated.

**1. Relation to spectral synthesis.** For every  $f$  in  $A(G)$  we denote by  $Z(f)$  the set of its zeros. If  $I$  is a closed ideal in  $A(G)$  we shall denote by  $Z(I)$  the set of common zeros of all functions in  $I$ . That is,

$$Z(I) = \bigcap_{f \in I} Z(f).$$

We shall denote by  $I(f)$  the closed ideal generated by  $f$ . Clearly,

$$(1.1) \quad Z(I(f)) = Z(f).$$

This shows, that for a closed singly generated ideal  $I$ ,  $Z(I)$  is a closed  $G_\delta$  set. For a closed  $E \subset G$  we denote by  $K(E)$  the ideal of all functions in  $A(G)$  which vanish on  $E$ . It is well known that the algebras  $A(G)$  are regular, that is, for ever closed set  $E \subset G$  we have:

$$(1.2) \quad Z(K(E)) = E.$$

From (1.1) and (1.2) it follows that if  $E$  is a closed set which is not a  $G_\delta$ ,  $K(E)$  is not singly generated. Recall that a closed set  $E \subset G$  is a set of spectral synthesis (an  $S$  set) if for every closed ideal  $I$  such that  $Z(I) = E$  we have  $I = K(E)$ . The regularity of  $A(G)$  implies that for every closed  $G_\delta$  set  $E \subset G$  there exists an  $f$  in  $A(G)$  such that  $Z(f) = E$  [7, pp. 419]. From this we infer that every closed ideal  $I$  such that  $Z(I)$  is  $G_\delta$ , and of spectral synthesis is singly generated. Hence, if  $G$  is discrete, every closed ideal in  $A(G)$  is singly generated, since in this case every subset of  $G$  is a  $S$ -set [4, pp. 159]. If every closed subset of  $G$  is a  $G_\delta$ , in particular if  $G$  is metrizable, it follows from the above discussion, that the problem of singly generated closed ideals in  $A(G)$  involves the consideration of sets which are not of spectral synthesis. It was proved by P. Malliavin [2] that every non-discrete locally compact abelian group  $G$  contains a closed subset which is not of spectral synthesis.

For a closed set  $E \subset G$  which is not an  $S$ -set it is natural to ask whether  $K(E)$  can be singly generated. We show that this can be the case. The well known example of L. Schwartz [5] shows that the unit sphere  $S_n$  in Euclidean  $n$ -space  $R^n$  is not an  $S$ -set for  $n \geq 3$ . However,  $K(S_n)$  is singly generated. This can be seen as follows: Let  $\mathcal{R}_n$  be the algebra of radial functions in  $A(R^n)$ . Consider the closed ideal  $K_{\mathcal{R}} = K(S_n) \cap \mathcal{R}_n$  in  $\mathcal{R}_n$ . It is proved in [6] that  $K_{\mathcal{R}}$  generates  $K(S_n)$  in  $A(R^n)$ . It is easy to see that  $K_{\mathcal{R}}$  is generated in  $\mathcal{R}_n$  by any  $f$  in  $\mathcal{R}_n$  such that  $Z(f) = S_n$  and  $f(x) = \sum_{k=1}^n x_k^2 - 1$  for  $x$  in a neighborhood of  $S_n$ . Hence  $K(S_n)$  is also generated by the same  $f$ .

2. **The algebras  $A(R^n)$ .** We consider the algebras  $A(R^n)$  for  $n \geq 6$ . In what follows  $p, q$  will denote positive integers such that  $p + q = n$ . Let  $S_{p,q} = S_p \times S_q$ . This section is devoted to the investigation of the ideal  $K_{p,q} = K(S_{p,q})$ . We consider  $R^n$  as  $R^p \times R^q$ , and use the notations:  $x = (u, v)$ ,  $x \in R^n$ ,  $u \in R^p$ ,  $v \in R^q$ .

$$r_1 = \|u\| = \left( \sum_{k=1}^p u_k^2 \right)^{1/2}, \quad r_2 = \|v\| = \left( \sum_{k=1}^q v_k^2 \right)^{1/2}.$$

We shall denote by  $\mathbf{P}^2$  the positive quadrant in the plane i.e.,

$$\mathbf{P}^2 = \{x \in R^2: x_j \geq 0, j = 1, 2\}.$$

Every point in  $R^n$  can be written in the form  $(r_1 s_1, r_2 s_2)$  where  $(r_1, r_2) \in \mathbf{P}^2$  and  $(s_1, s_2) \in S_{p,q}$ . We shall also denote by  $\mathcal{R}_{p,q}$  the algebra of bi-radial functions in  $A(R^n)$  with respect to the pair  $(p, q)$ . That is,  $\mathcal{R}_{p,q}$  consists of those  $f$  in  $A(R^n)$  such that  $f(u_1, v_1) = f(u_2, v_2)$  whenever  $\|u_1\| = \|u_2\|$  and  $\|v_1\| = \|v_2\|$ . Every  $f$  in  $\mathcal{R}_{p,q}$  will be identified with a function defined on  $\mathbf{P}^2$ . By abuse of language we shall sometimes write  $f(u, v) = f(r_1, r_2)$  for  $f$  in  $\mathcal{R}_{p,q}$ . It is known [6] that for  $p \geq 3, q \geq 3$ , every  $f \in \mathcal{R}_{p,q}$  has continuous first order partial derivatives for  $r_j > 0, j = 1, 2$ , and the mappings  $\delta'_j(1, 1): f \rightarrow \partial f / \partial r_j(1, 1), j = 1, 2, f \in \mathcal{R}_{p,q}$ , are bounded linear functionals on  $\mathcal{R}_{p,q}$ . Let  $\mu_k$  be the homogeneously distributed measure on  $S_k$  with total mass 1, and  $\mu_{p,q} = \mu_p \times \mu_q$  the product measure on  $S_{p,q}$ . For every continuous function  $f$  on  $R^n$ , we define its bi-radial mean by:

$$(2.1) \quad M_{p,q}(f)(r_1, r_2) = \int_{S_{p,q}} f(r_1 s_1, r_2 s_2) d\mu_{p,q}(s_1, s_2), \quad (r_1, r_2) \in \mathbf{P}^2.$$

$M_{p,q}$  restricted to  $A(R^n)$  is a bounded linear operator onto  $\mathcal{R}_{p,q}$ . The following properties of  $M_{p,q}$  are easily verified:

$$(2.2) \quad M_{p,q}f = f \quad \text{for } f \text{ in } \mathcal{R}_{p,q};$$

$$(2.3) \quad M_{p,q}(fg) = fM_{p,q}(g) \quad \text{for } f \in \mathcal{A}_{p,q}, \quad g \in A(\mathbb{R}^n);$$

$$(2.4) \quad |M_{p,q}(fg)(r_1, r_2)| \leq \|g\| M_{p,q}(|f|)(r_1, r_2) \quad \text{for } (r_1, r_2) \in \mathbf{P}^2, f, g \text{ in } A(\mathbb{R}^n)$$

Finally we define two bounded linear functionals  $\Delta_k, k = 1, 2$  on  $A(\mathbb{R}^n)$ :

$$(2.5) \quad \langle \Delta_k, f \rangle = \langle \delta_{k'}, M_{p,q}f \rangle, \quad k = 1, 2.$$

**THEOREM 2.1.** *For  $p \geq 3, q \geq 3$ , the ideal  $K_{p,q}$  is not generated by any  $f$  in  $A_r(\mathbb{R}^n)$ .*

**Proof.** Let  $f \in A_r(\mathbb{R}^n), Z(f) = S_{p,q}$ . We shall show that  $I(f) \neq K_{p,q}$ . The complement of  $S_{p,q}$  in  $\mathbb{R}^n$  is connected, hence  $f$  has fixed sign outside  $S_{p,q}$ , and we may assume that

$$(2.6) \quad f(x) > 0 \quad \text{for } x \notin S_{p,q}, \quad Z(f) = S_{p,q}.$$

By (2.1) and (2.6) we have:

$$(2.7) \quad M_{p,q}(f)(1,1) = 0;$$

$$(2.8) \quad M_{p,q}(f)(r_1, r_2) > 0, \quad (r_1, r_2) \neq (1,1).$$

Hence  $M_{p,q}(f)$  has a local minimum at  $(1,1)$ , and we obtain:

$$(2.9) \quad \langle \Delta_1, f \rangle = 0.$$

From (2.4) and (2.6) it follows that for every  $g$  in  $A(\mathbb{R}^n)$ ,

$$|M_{p,q}(fg)(r_1, r_2)| \leq \|g\| M_{p,q}(f)(r_1, r_2) \quad \text{for all } (r_1, r_2) \in \mathbf{P}^2.$$

This together with (2.7) and (2.9) implies:

$$(2.10) \quad \langle \Delta_1, fg \rangle = 0.$$

Since (2.10) holds for every  $g$  in  $A(\mathbb{R}^n)$ , we infer that  $\Delta_1$  annihilates  $I(f)$ . But  $\Delta_1$  does not annihilate  $K_{p,q}$  since for  $h$  in  $\mathcal{A}_{p,q}$  which is equal to  $r_1 - 1$  in a neighborhood of  $S_{p,q}$  we have  $\langle \Delta_1, h \rangle = 1$ . This completes the proof.

**COROLLARY 1.** *In the algebras  $A(\mathbb{R}^n), n \geq 6$ , there exist self adjoint closed ideals which are not generated by any function in  $A_r(\mathbb{R}^n)$ .*

**COROLLARY 2.** *The algebras  $A_r(\mathbb{R}^n), n \geq 6$ , contain closed ideals which are not singly generated.*

**REMARK.** It is proved in [4, 181-183] that for every non-discrete locally compact abelian group  $G, A(G)$  contains closed ideals which are not self adjoint.

Clearly, such ideals are not generated by any  $f$  in  $A_r(G)$ . Hence the main point in Corollary 1 is that for  $G = R^n$ ,  $n \geq 6$ ,  $A(G)$  contains self adjoint closed ideals which are not generated by any real function.

In Section 1 we have seen that the ideals  $K(S_n)$  are generated by a radial function. We show now that the corresponding result does not hold for  $K_{p,q}$ .

**THEOREM 2.2.** *For  $p \geq 3$ ,  $q \geq 3$ , the ideal  $K_{p,q}$  is not generated by any function in  $\mathcal{R}_{p,q}$ .*

**Proof.** Let  $f \in \mathcal{R}_{p,q} \cap K_{p,q}$ ; hence,

$$(2.11) \quad f(1, 1) = 0.$$

Let  $c_1, c_2$ , be constants,  $|c_1| + |c_2| > 0$ , such that

$$(2.12) \quad c_1 \frac{\partial f}{\partial r_1}(1, 1) + c_2 \frac{\partial f}{\partial r_2}(1, 1) = 0.$$

Let  $\Delta_1, \Delta_2$  be as in (2.5), we define:

$$\Delta = c_1 \Delta_1 + c_2 \Delta_2.$$

By (2.11), (2.12) and (2.3) we have:

$$(2.13) \quad \langle \Delta, fg \rangle = 0$$

for every  $g$  in  $A(R^n)$ , hence  $\Delta$  annihilates  $I(f)$ . Taking  $h$  in  $\mathcal{R}_{p,q}$  which coincides with  $\bar{c}_1(r_1 - 1) + \bar{c}_2(r_2 - 1)$  in a neighborhood of  $S_{p,q}$  we have  $h \in K_{p,q}$  but  $\langle \Delta, h \rangle = |c_1|^2 + |c_2|^2 \neq 0$ ; hence  $\Delta$  does not annihilate  $K_{p,q}$ . This shows that  $I(f) \neq K_{p,q}$ , and the theorem is proved.

**COROLLARY.** *The algebras  $\mathcal{R}_{p,q}$   $p \geq 3$ ,  $q \geq 3$ , contain closed ideals which are not singly generated.*

**REMARK.** All the preceding results are true for the algebras  $A(T^n)$ ,  $n \geq 6$ . ( $T$  as usual, denotes the circle group). This follows from the well known local isomorphism between  $A(R^n)$  and  $A(T^n)$ , if we replace the spheres  $S_p$  and  $S_q$  by sufficiently small spheres in  $T^p$  and  $T^q$  respectively.

The results of this section strongly support the conjecture that the ideals  $K_{p,q}$ ,  $p \geq 3$ ,  $q \geq 3$ , are not singly generated in  $A(R^n)$ . However, one can show as in Section 1, that  $K_{p,q}$  is generated by two functions in  $\mathcal{R}_{p,q}$ .

**3. General Groups.** Let  $G$  be a locally compact abelian group, and  $f_1, f_2$ , functions in  $A_r(G)$ . We denote as usual by  $C(R^2)$  the set of all continuous com-

plex functions on  $R^2$ . For  $\Phi$  in  $C(R^2)$  we shall denote by  $\Phi(f_1, f_2)$  the continuous function on  $G$  whose value at every  $g \in G$  is  $\Phi(f_1(g), f_2(g))$ . For every subset  $E \subset G$  we denote by  $[f_1, f_2]_E$  the set of all  $f$  in  $A(G)$  for which there exist some  $\Phi$  in  $C(R^2)$  such that  $f(g) = \Phi(f_1, f_2)(g)$  for every  $g \in E$ . It is easy to see that  $[f_1, f_2]_E$  is the set of all functions in  $A(G)$ , which identify every pair of points in  $E$ , which is identified by both  $f_1$  and  $f_2$ . Clearly  $[f_1, f_2]_E$  is a closed subalgebra of  $A(G)$ .

**THEOREM 3.1.** *Let  $G$  be a non-discrete locally compact abelian group. There exist two functions  $f_1$  and  $f_2$  in  $A_r(G)$  and a compact subset  $E \subset G$ , such that the closed ideal generated by  $f_1$  and  $f_2$  in  $A(G)$ , is not generated by any  $f \in [f_1, f_2]_E$ .*

In the proof of Theorem 3.1 we shall use the methods introduced by P. Malliavin in [3]. We shall need the following:

**LEMMA.** *Let  $G$  be as in Theorem 3.1. There exist two functions  $f_1$  and  $f_2$  in  $A_r(G)$  and a positive, non-trivial, regular Borel measure  $\nu$  on  $G$ , with compact support, such that,*

$$(3.1) \quad \|\exp[-i(u f_1 + v f_2)]\nu\|_{A^*(G)} \leq (u^2 + v^2)^{-2}$$

for all real  $u$  and  $v$ ,  $(u, v) \neq (0, 0)$ .

This lemma is proved in [3] for non-discrete compact groups  $G$ , with  $\nu$  as the Haar measure of  $G$ . The general case follows from the compact one by using the fact that for every non-discrete locally compact abelian group  $G$ , there exist a non discrete compact abelian group  $H$ , such that  $A(G)$  and  $A(H)$  are locally isomorphic. This follows from [4, pp. 41, 55, 56].

**Proof of Theorem 3.1.** Consider  $f_1, f_2$  and  $\nu$  which satisfy (3.1). We shall denote by  $I(f_1, f_2)$  the closed ideal generated by  $f_1$  and  $f_2$  in  $A(G)$ . Let  $E$  be the support of  $\nu$ . We shall show that for  $f \in I(f_1, f_2) \cap [f_1, f_2]_E$  we have,  $I(f) \neq I(f_1, f_2)$ . For every  $h$  in  $A(G)$ , let  $d\mu_h$  be the image of the measure  $h d\nu$  by the continuous map:

$$g \rightarrow (f_1(g), f_2(g)), \quad g \in E;$$

$d\mu_h$  is a measure on  $R^2$  with compact support, and for every  $\Phi \in C(R^2)$  we have:

$$(3.2) \quad \int_{R^2} \Phi(x, y) d\mu_h(x, y) = \int_G \Phi(f_1(g), f_2(g)) h(g) d\nu(g).$$

Hence the Fourier transform of  $d\mu_h$  is given by:

$$(3.3) \quad \hat{\mu}_h(u, v) = \int_G \exp[-i(uf_1(g) + vf_2(g))] h(g) dv(g).$$

From (3.1) and (3.3) we infer that  $|\hat{\mu}(u, v)| \leq \|h\| (u^2 + v^2)^{-2}$ ,  $(u, v) \neq (0, 0)$ . Therefore by the inversion theorem

$$d\mu_h(x, y) = m_h(x, y) dx dy$$

where  $m_h$  is a differentiable function on  $R^2$  with compact support. Taking  $h$  in  $A(G)$  such that  $h(g) = 1$  for  $g \in E$ , it follows from (3.3) that  $\hat{m}_1(0, 0) = v(E) \neq 0$ . Hence  $m_1$  is not identically zero, and by replacing  $f_1$  and  $f_2$  by  $f_1 + ak$  and  $f_2 + bk$ , where  $a, b$  are real constants, and  $k$  a function in  $A_r(G)$  which is equal to 1 on  $E$ , (3.1) is not altered, and we may assume that:

$$(3.4) \quad m_1(0, 0) \neq 0.$$

For every  $h$  in  $A(G)$  we have:

$$(3.5) \quad (D_1 m_h)(0, 0) = \frac{1}{4\pi^2} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} (iu) \langle \exp[i(uf_1 + vf_2)] v, h \rangle dudv;$$

$$(3.6) \quad (D_2 m_h)(0, 0) = \frac{1}{4\pi^2} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} (iv) \langle \exp[i(uf_1 + vf_2)] v, h \rangle dudv.$$

(Here  $D_1$  and  $D_2$  denote differentiation with respect to  $x$  and  $y$  respectively).

From (3.1), (3.5), and (3.6) it follows that the mappings:

$$\omega_k: h \rightarrow (D_k m_h)(0, 0), \quad k = 1, 2, \quad h \in A(G),$$

are bounded linear functionals on  $A(G)$ . Let  $f \in [f_1, f_2]_E$ . It is easily verified that for every  $\Phi \in C(R^2)$  such that  $\Phi(f_1, f_2) = f$  on  $E$ , and  $h \in A(G)$  we have:

$$(3.7) \quad m_{fh} = \Phi m_h.$$

By taking  $h \in A(G)$  such that  $h = 1$  on  $E$ , we infer from (3.4) and (3.7) that  $\Phi$  is differentiable at  $(0, 0)$ . Assume now in addition that  $f \in I(f_1, f_2)$ . We shall show that

$$(3.8) \quad \Phi(0, 0) = 0.$$

From (3.5) we see that the support<sup>2</sup> of  $\omega_1$  is contained in  $E$ . From (3.7) it follows that for every  $h \in A(G)$  we have,

$$\langle \omega_1, (f_1^2 + f_2^2)h \rangle = 0.$$

---

<sup>2</sup> For the definition of support of a bounded linear functional on  $A(G)$ , and related properties, we refer the reader to [1, Chap. VIII].

Thus  $\omega_1$  annihilates  $I(f_1^2 + f_2^2)$ , hence its support lies in  $Z(f_1) \cap Z(f_2)$ . Since  $\omega_1 \neq 0$ , we conclude that  $E \cap Z(f_1) \cap Z(f_2)$  is not empty, and taking  $g$  in this set we get, using the fact that  $f \in I(f_1, f_2) \cap [f_1, f_2]_E$ :

$$\Phi(0, 0) = \Phi(f_1(g), f_2(g)) = f(g) = 0.$$

Let  $\alpha, \beta$ , be constants such that  $|\alpha| + |\beta| > 0$ , and

$$(3.9) \quad \alpha(D_1\Phi)(0, 0) + \beta(D_2\Phi)(0, 0) = 0.$$

We define a bounded linear functional,

$$\omega = \alpha\omega_1 + \beta\omega_2.$$

By (3.7), (3.8), and (3.9) we have for every  $h \in A(G)$

$$\langle \omega, fh \rangle = 0.$$

That is,  $\omega$  annihilates  $I(f)$ . Since  $\langle \omega, \bar{\alpha}f_2 + \bar{\beta}f_2 \rangle = (|\alpha|^2 + |\beta|^2)m_1(0, 0) \neq 0$ ,  $\omega$  does not annihilate  $I(f_1, f_2)$ , and the theorem is proved.

**COROLLARY.** *For every non-discrete locally compact abelian group  $G$ ,  $A(G)$  contains a closed sub-algebra with closed ideals which are not singly generated.*

#### REFERENCES

1. Y. Katznelson, *An introduction to harmonic analysis*, Wiley, 1968.
2. P. Malliavin, *Impossibilité de la synthèse spectrale sur les groupes abéliens non compacts*, Publ. Math. de Inst. Hautes Etudes Sci. Paris (1959), 61–68.
3. P. Malliavin, *Calcul symbolique et sous-algèbres de  $L^1(G)$* , Bull. Soc. Math. France, **87** (1959), 181–190.
4. W. Rudin, *Fourier analysis on groups*, Interscience, 1962.
5. L. Schwartz, *Sur une propriété de synthèse spectrale dans les groupes non compacts*, C.R. Acad. Sci. Paris **227** (1948), 424–426.
6. N. Th. Varopoulos, *Spectral synthesis on spheres*, Proc. Cambridge Phil. Soc. **62** (1966), 379–387.
7. C. R. Warner, *Closed ideals in the group algebra  $L^1(G) \cap L^2(G)$* , Trans. Amer. Math. Soc. **121** (1966), 408–423.

DEPARTMENT OF MATHEMATICS

TEL AVIV UNIVERSITY, TEL AVIV